

**WEST WHITELAND TOWNSHIP
Historical Commission
Agenda
Monday, July 13, 2020
7:00 P.M.**

This Meeting will be held by teleconference via Zoom.

CALL TO ORDER

PUBLIC COMMENT

OLD BUSINESS

1. Applicant: Exton Knoll
Class III Site 028 – Old Autocar Himes Trucking & Site 344 – Dr. R.B. Carey's Barn (Both Demolished)
Address: 891-921 E. Lincoln Hwy.
Request: Recommendation for Subdivision and Land Development Approval for the construction of 319 housing units consisting of 99 carriage homes and 220 apartments.
2. Township Historical Survey Update: CHG demonstration of survey form and project update
3. CHG Arrandale Barn update & review

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: June 8, 2020

HISTORICAL COMMISSION CONCERNS

1. Ship Rd. Couplet discussion

TOWNSHIP UPDATE

ADJOURNMENT

NEXT MEETING: August 10, 2020

Directions to access the Zoom Meeting

Option 1:

Click on this link to register: https://us02web.zoom.us/meeting/register/tZYpdeyuqD8iHNG__1Y6TsZiHB4H_Tevs_g

Option 2:

Use your phone and call +1-646-558-8656. When asked, enter the Meeting and Password.

[Virtual Meeting Etiquette Zoom](#)

[Instructions](#)

If you have any questions regarding the projects please e-mail us at questions@westwhiteland.org



West Chester Office
535 N. Church Street, West Chester, PA 19380
P: 610.436.9000 | F: 610.436.8468
commonwealthheritagegroup.com

June 9, 2020
WC-382

To: Mr. John Weller, AICP

From: Philip Yocum, NCARB, LEED AP
Preservation Architect
Commonwealth Heritage Group

Re: Preliminary/Final Subdivision and Land Development Application
Exton Knoll Residential Development
Bentley Homes
891, 901 & 921 E. Lincoln Highway
Exton PA., 19341

Dear Mr. Weller,

A Preliminary/Final Subdivision and Land Development Application has been submitted by Bentley Homes for the development of 319 new residences at 891, 901 & 921 E. Lincoln Highway. The proposed project includes 99 carriage homes, 220 townhouses, a clubhouse, and open space. The 56.58 acre property is located on the north side of East Lincoln Highway, immediately west of the Church Farm School (CFS) academic campus. The site is within West Whiteland Township's O/R Office/Residential zoning district.

In accordance with the West Whiteland Township Zoning Ordinance, Article XVI: Historic Preservation, Commonwealth Heritage Group (hereinafter Commonwealth) has reviewed the proposed undertaking for potential impacts on the Township's designated historic resources.

Commonwealth previously reviewed a Bentley Homes Conditional Use submission for the Exton Knoll property on November 5, 2019. Commonwealth also previously reviewed the Bentley Homes Conditional Use and Land Development submissions for the adjacent Lochiel Farm Residential Development in 2017, 2018, and 2019. Exton Knoll is also being developed by Bentley Homes and is connected by an internal drive to the Lochiel Farm Development.

Review Documents

For this review Commonwealth utilized the following submission documents:

- Exton Knoll Application, May 19, 2020
- Exton Knoll Subdivision/Land Use Plans, Dwgs. 1 thru 37, D.L. Howell Associates, Inc., May 15, 2020
- Exton Knoll Post Construction Stormwater Management Report, D.L. Howell Associates, Inc., May 15, 2020
- Exton Knoll/Weston Declaration of Covenants

No current architectural plans, building elevations or renderings of the proposed carriage houses, townhouses, or clubhouse facility were provided for Commonwealth's review. Therefore, other than overall site

arrangement and building footprint, this review cannot accurately comment on the impact the final architectural design may have on any historic resources.

Historic Resources Impacted by the Proposed Project

In accordance with Section 325-92.A of the Township Zoning Ordinance, Class I, II, or III historic resources listed on the West Whiteland Township inventory that are located within the boundary of a proposed project site or within 300-feet of the boundary of a proposed project site shall be reviewed for potential adverse effect. Commonwealth's review has determined the following listed historic resources lie within 300 feet of the property:

Historic Resources located within the boundary of the proposed Project Site - One structure located on the project site is listed on the townships inventory as Historic Sites:

- **Site #344** – 731-733 E. Lincoln Highway. Dr. R.B. Carey's Barn, Built c. 1880 for local physician's estate.
 - Class III Historic Resource, Listed in Historical Resource Inventory

Note: This structure was destroyed (by fire?) after being listed as a historic resource. The remains of the structure are no longer visible.

Adjacent Historic Resources within 300 feet of the proposed Project Site – One structure located within 300 feet of the project site is listed on the townships inventory as Historic Sites:

- **Site #028** – E. Lincoln Highway. Commercial Building.
 - Class III Historic Resource, Listed in Historical Resource Inventory

Note: This structure was demolished after being listed as a historic resource. The property has been redeveloped as part of a corporate park on the south side of East Lincoln Highway.

Description of the Proposed Undertaking

The proposed Exton Knoll Residential Development is located on a 56.58 acre site extending from the north side of East Lincoln Highway (Route 30) to the south side of the Chester Valley Trail. Along its eastern boundary the project site is adjacent to the CFS academic campus on the north side of East Lincoln Highway. The site is comprised of seven individual land parcels. The three western parcels contain three one-story commercial structures, clustered along the north side of Route 30. The four eastern parcels contain a small office building, two dwellings, two garages, an automotive repair shop, a small warehouse, and a pump house. The project proposes to demolish all of the existing structures, with the exception of the pump house which is located at the northwestern corner of the overall property.

Bentley Homes proposes construction of 99 carriage homes (for sale) and 220 townhouses (for rent), with a clubhouse, pool, and open space. Residential units will be clustered in groups of 2, 3, 4 and 5 units. Located at the eastern section of the property, the carriage homes and open parking areas are organized in a rectilinear pattern around a central open park featuring a clubhouse and pool. The western section of the property contains townhouses, less densely sited along two winding streets. The townhouses appear to contain two car garages and individual driveways.

The area of new construction covers approximately 75% of the overall site. The remaining 25% of the site is open space, primarily located in a wetlands area at the northern portion of the property. The northern open space is approximately 400 feet deep and the full width of the Exton Knoll property. Walking trails connect the residential development to the Chester Valley Trail which runs along the property's northern boundary.

Most of the new residences along East Lincoln Highway are setback approximately 50 feet from the south property boundary. Along the west property boundary shared with the adjacent Lochiel Farm residential

development, the new carriage homes are located within 50 feet of the boundary. At the east property boundary shared with the Church Farm School campus, the new townhouses are approximately 50 feet from the boundary. This will allow a full view of the new development from the adjacent CFS campus. No proposed landscaping is included in the submission, so potential vegetative screening could not be evaluated.

Review of the Potential Effects on Historic Resources:

Commonwealth's review is limited to the potential for effect on the above mentioned historic resources. Commonwealth conducted a field review at the site of the historic resources to evaluate the potential effect of the proposed Exton Knoll Residential Development project. Our comments are limited to the potential for adverse affect, and recommendations for treatment and/or mitigation.

As previously noted the two historic sites potentially impacted by the Carriage Home Community project, Sites #344 and #028 were both demolished sometime after being listed as historic resources in 1982. Therefore the proposed project will have no adverse effect on those sites.

The adjacent Church Farm School property contains numerous listed historic resources; however, none are within 300 feet of the Exton Knoll project boundaries. Regardless, the new construction will be very visible from the CFS campus. Therefore it is recommended that extensive vegetative screening be provided along the eastern boundary of the Frame Property.

Conclusion: No adverse effect was found for the two Listed Class III Historic Resources, Site #344, and Site #028, which previously lied within the affected area of the Frame Property Carriage Home Community site but have been demolished.

General Recommendations for the Exton Knoll Residential Development:

1. Vegetative screening should be carefully developed to screen the densely developed Exton Knoll property along Route 30 to the south, and the Church Farm School campus to the east.
2. Develop two interpretive information markers to explain the history of the township. One should document West Whiteland Township's rich settlement and agricultural history, including its c. 1880 use as a country farm by Dr. R.B. Carey. The second marker should document the township's important history as a home for pre-historic Native Americans. Final marker locations should be publicly visible and determined in consultation with the Historical Commission. The farming history marker could be placed near the community clubhouse and the Native American history marker could be placed adjacent to the Chester Valley Trail.

Should you have any questions or comments please do not hesitate to contact this office.

Regards,



Philip Yocum, RA, LEED AP
Preservation Architect

cc: Justin Smiley - WWT
Candice Strawley - Commonwealth



West Chester Office

535 N. Church Street, West Chester, PA 19380

P: 610.436.9000 | F: 610.436.8468

commonwealthheritagegroup.com

June 24, 2020
WC-382

To: Mr. John Weller, AICP

From: Philip Yocum, RA, LEED AP
Preservation Architect
Commonwealth Heritage Group

Re: Demolition Application
Arrandale Barn
June 9, 2020 Site Visit

Dear Mr. Weller,

Arrandale Associates has requested that West Whiteland Township (WWT) permit the demolition of the Arrandale Barn, which is associated with the ca. 1810 Arrandale Farm complex located at 600 W. Lincoln Highway in the Oaklands Corporate Center. Commonwealth previously reviewed the demolition application and documented our findings in a review letter dated January 9, 2020.

As a follow up that review, West Whiteland Township requested that Commonwealth visit the barn for a tour of the barn exterior and interior with the applicant. The barn tour was delayed due to winter schedule conflicts and the Covid-19 Pennsylvania lockdown. On June 9, 2020 Philip Yocum and Candice Strawley of Commonwealth visited the Arrandale property with the applicant Chris Knauer. Our tour included the Arrandale barn and the adjacent Arrandale manor house. Historic resources listed on the Township's Historic Resource Inventory include:

- **Site #119** – 600 W. Lincoln Highway. Stone, frame tenant house for Arrandale...Core was springhouse.
 - Demolished, Site or Ruins.....Note: Springhouse is intact
- **Site #120** – 600 W. Lincoln Highway. Arrandale. Federal Style manor house within large farm complex. Built c. 1810 for Hunt Downing.
 - Class I Historic Resource, Listed on the National Register
- **Site #121** – 600 W. Lincoln Highway. Stone tenant house for Arrandale.
 - Demolished, Site or Ruins
- **Site #122** – 600 W. Lincoln Highway. Stone, frame tenant house for Arrandale.
 - Class I Historic Resource, Listed on the National Register

The Arrandale barn is not included on the Township's Historic Resource Inventory, however it is judged to be a significant historic resource, particularly for its association with Arrandale manor house. The barn is included for protection in a condominium agreement as described in our January 9, 2020 letter.

Mr. Knauer was gracious in providing access to the exterior and interior of both the barn and manor house. The original section of the stone barn is fully exposed on the north (front), east and west sides. The barn is clad in metal siding and roofing, which appears to have been installed over the existing wood siding/roofing. Mr. Knauer said his company purchased the barn in 1987. The metal cladding, exterior stone repointing, and interior structural cable reinforcing were installed by the previous owner. Mr. Knauer's company originally used the building for storage of equipment and building materials. The barn is now empty.

The barn is a standard Pennsylvania Barn type, which can be identified through its banked construction and projecting frame forebay. The original stone section probably dates to the first quarter of the nineteenth century. Construction of the original barn may coincide with the 1810 Arrandale manor house. The current barn configuration is 'L' shaped consisting of the original main stone barn section, expanded to the rear by a narrow frame over stone addition at the southeast corner. The front (north) side of the barn features central barn doors accessed from an earthen ramp, opening to the upper main floor. The main floor contains a typical wood framed forebay at the rear (south) side cantilevering over the lower level barnyard. The barnyard connects directly with the barn's lower level and enclosed with deteriorating stone walls at the west and south sides.

The front barn doors are flanked by two, projecting stone and frame outshed additions. These outsheds are distinctive and somewhat unusual in Chester County barns. On our first visit two years ago, the east outshed was missing a small section of metal roof. The metal roof apparently blew off and still lies on the ground beside the barn. No repairs have been made to the roof over the last two years. As a result, the front wall of the east outshed has drastically deteriorated due to water infiltration, causing the roof and floor structure in that area to deteriorate. The distinctive pair of large wood panel doors on the east side of the outshed now stand open, allowing additional weather infiltration. The east side outshed appears to be in poor condition. The west side outshed is slightly larger and features a distinctive projecting wood bay on the west elevation. The west outshed appears sound from the exterior but could not be accessed from the upper level. From the lower level it appeared the wood floor framing in the west outshed may be collapsing but could be repaired.

The upper level interior of the barn exhibits previous repairs with (pre-1987) wire cabling and some framing repair. The floor deck and framing has deteriorated in isolated areas, particularly at the south forebay overhanging the barnyard. However, the damage was not extensive and beyond repair. Generally, the building was quite dry, except for the east outshed. The southeast rear addition is an interesting form. It features horse stalls and a pass-thru section for vehicles or livestock at the lower level. This addition, with its horse stalls, may date to the turn-of-the-century period when fox hunts were active in West Whiteland. At the upper, first floor, level it features a finished hardwood floor with painted markings and a basketball backboard and hoop at one end. A raised section is located toward the south end of the space, corresponding to the lower level pass-thru opening. This raised section with stairs has the appearance of an elevated stage, particularly with the room's finished hardwood floor, but this may be coincidence. Overall, this is a tall narrow space that was likely built for hay storage; later converted to an indoor basketball court. The upper level of the southeast rear addition is generally in good condition.

The rear barnyard is a large area densely filled with small trees and vegetation. This makes it difficult to access the barn's lower level or visually observe the exterior barn walls facing into the barnyard. We did create a pathway to the barn's lower interior level which contained livestock stalls and a milking area. The milking area retains the head restraints for the cows and other details. A turkey vulture was

Mr. John Weller, AICP

June 24, 2020

Page 3

trapped in the lower level and hindered our investigation of the western section. The two front outshed additions extend to the lower level, but their wood floors are collapsing. The lower level of the southeast rear addition contains horse stalls accessed directly from the barnyard or through a tack room in the main barn structure. Overall, the barn retains many early elements and details, including wide wood flooring, stall doors, tack room saddle racks, and antique hardware.

While at the site Mr. Knauer provided a tour of the Arrandale manor house, which served as their corporate offices until recently. The main structure is a notable 1810 Federal period masonry house with fine detailing and woodwork. The house structure retains much of its early architectural fabric and is in excellent condition. The 1810 manor house was an addition to an earlier two-bay eighteenth century masonry structure, still attached on the west side. This building is likely the original farmhouse associated with the property. An adjacent structure, Site # 122, is listed as a stone and frame tenant house. However, the form of this small building with a cantilevering rear forebay, supported by a central stone pier, indicates this building may have been an early barn. It is possible this small barn was associated with the original section of the Arrandale Manor house.

Conclusion: Although the setting has been compromised by the adjacent modern office buildings, the historic Arrandale Farm complex retains a high degree of integrity. The Arrandale property is highly unique in that it illustrates the evolution of the region's agricultural history by containing multiple resources from both the eighteenth and nineteenth century. The significance of the property is strengthened through the relationship between the remaining resources, which describe a more robust understanding of the property's history. Demolition of the Arrandale Barn will obviously have a severe adverse effect on the historic barn. However, the barn's demolition will also have a severe adverse effect on the two remaining Listed Class 1 Historic Resources, Site #120, and Site #122. The demolition of the barn would be particularly detrimental to the significance of the property's agricultural history.

The Arrandale barn is quite large, with several distinctive additions and features. The barn's size also makes its preservation more challenging. We encourage the Township and the owner to develop a plan that retains the most significant portions of the Arrandale barn, including the main original barn section, the west outshed, and the barnyard walls. Preservation of the barn through adaptive reuse is the preferred approach. If the barn is eventually approved for demolition, consideration should be given to restricting any future construction on the site. Replacing the barn with a new commercial/residential building, parking lot, or roadway would reward the owner's long-term neglect of this historic resource. While not the preferred outcome, preserving the historic barn as a ruin in a natural setting would better memorialize the property's agricultural history.

Should you have any questions or comments please do not hesitate to contact this office.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Philip Yocum". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Philip Yocum, RA, LEED AP
Preservation Architect

cc: Justin Smiley - WWT
Candice Strawley - Commonwealth