

**WEST WHITELAND TOWNSHIP
Historical Commission
Agenda
Monday, January 13, 2020
7:00 P.M.**

CALL TO ORDER

REORGANIZATION

PUBLIC COMMENT

OLD BUSINESS

1. Applicant: Lochiel Farm Historic Resource Renovations
Address: 701 Livingston Ln.
Historic Sites: 339 Lochiel Farm Tenant House (Class II) & 341 Lochiel Farm Manor House (Class I Listed NR)
Request: Recommendation to approve Plans dated 12.31.19 for the renovation of the Lochiel Farm Manor and Tenant Houses.

NEW BUSINESS

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: December 9, 2020

HISTORICAL COMMISSION CONCERNS

TOWNSHIP UPDATE

ADJOURNMENT

NEXT MEETING: February 10, 2020



West Chester Office

535 N. Church Street, West Chester, PA 19380
P: 610.436.9000 | F: 610.436.8468

commonwealthheritagegroup.com

January 9, 2020
WC-382

To: Mr. John Weller, AICP

From: Philip Yocum, RA, LEED AP
Preservation Architect
Commonwealth Heritage Group

Re: Historical Commission Design Review
Manor House and Tenant House
Lochiel Farm Development
740 N. Ship Road
Exton PA., 19341

Dear Mr. Weller,

Architectural Concepts, PC has submitted design plans of the Manor House and Tenant House at the Lochiel Farm located at 740 N. Ship Road in Exton. Commonwealth previously reviewed the Final Land Development Application for the Lochiel Farm project, as documented in our review letter of January 10, 2019. The West Whiteland Township (WWT) project approvals require that the Historical Commission review the final design proposals for the renovation of the Manor House and Tenant House. Architectural Concepts, PC has submitted their design documents in compliance with that final approval requirement.

In accordance with the West Whiteland Township Zoning Ordinance, Article XVI: Historic Preservation, Commonwealth Heritage Group (hereinafter Commonwealth) has reviewed the proposed undertaking for potential impacts on the Township's designated historic resources.

Review Documents

For this review Commonwealth utilized the documents prepared by Architectural Concepts, PC, Exton, Pennsylvania. The submitted documents are as follows:

- Lochiel Farm Manor House Drawings, December 31, 2019
 - SP-1 – Overall Project Site Plan
 - SP-2 – Detail of Site Plan at Manor and Tenant Houses
 - Manor PH-1 – Exterior Photographs
 - Manor EX-1, EX-2, EX-3 – First, Second, and Third Floor Existing Plans
 - Manor A-1, A-2, A-3 – First, Second and Third Floor Design Plans
 - Manor A-4 – Front (North) Design Elevation
- Lochiel Farm Tenant House Drawings, December 31, 2019
 - SP-1 – Overall Project Site Plan
 - SP-2 – Detail of Site Plan at Manor and Tenant Houses
 - Tenant PH-1 – Exterior Photographs

- Tenant EX-0, EX-1, EX-2, EX-3 – Basement, First, Second, and Third Floor Existing Plans
 - Tenant EX-4 -Existing Building Section and Detail
 - Tenant A-0, A-1, A-2, A-3 – Basement First, Second and Third Floor Design Plans
 - Tenant A-4 – Front (Northeast), Right Side, Rear, and Left Side Design Elevations
- Historic Resource Impact Study for the Lochiel Farm, prepared by RGA, March 2017

Historic Resources Impacted by the Proposed Project

In accordance with Section 325-92.A of the Township Zoning Ordinance, Class I, II, or III historic resources located within the boundary of a proposed project site or within 300-feet of the boundary of a proposed project site shall be reviewed for potential adverse effect. Commonwealth's review of the submission has determined that the following designated historic resources are impacted by the proposed Lochiel Farm Townhouse Development:

Historic Resources within the proposed Project Site:

- **Site #341** – Lochiel Farm (Main House), 111 N. Ship Road, c. 1814
- Class I Historic Resource, Listed on the National Register
- **Site #339** – Tenant House for Lochiel Farm, 115 N. Ship Road,
- Class II Historic Resource
- **Site #340** – Tenant House/ former harness shop, tack room for Lochiel Farm, 113 N. Ship Road,
- Class III Historic Resource

Adjacent Historic Resources within 300 feet of the proposed Project Site:

- **Site #313** – Hickory Hearth, 116 N. Ship Road,
- Class III historic 300 feet of the Lochiel Farm property:
- **Site #312** – First Ship School, 111 N. Ship Road, 1857-1867
- Class II Historic Resource
- **Site #338** – Evan Lewis House, 117 N. Ship Road, c. 1717
- Class I Historic Resource, Listed on the National Register

Commonwealth's review is limited to the effect on the above mentioned historic resources. Commonwealth conducted a field review at the sites of the historic resources listed above to evaluate the potential effect of the proposed residential townhouses and related site work.

Review of the Impact on the Historic Resources:

A detailed review on the historic resources listed above was undertaken during the Lochiel Farm Land Development Review Process. The Land Development submission was previously reviewed and recommended for approval by the WWT Historical Commission. The approved design included the relocation of the Tenant House (Site #339) to the northwest corner of the property adjacent to the Manor House (Site #341). The Tenant House/ former harness shop (Site #340) was approved for demolition. There was found to be no adverse effect on the First Ship School (Site #312) and the Evan Lewis House (site #338). This review is therefore limited to the specific renovation design treatment of the Manor House and the Tenant House.

Review of the Proposed Design for the Manor and Tenant Houses:

Manor House – Site #341

The proposed design for the Manor House removes the deteriorating frame additions at the east and west sides of the building. The main stone structure is retained and a 2-story stone addition at the east side will be retained. The first-floor plan largely retains the existing spaces and introduces a small powder room. The second and

Mr. John Weller, AICP

January 9, 2020

Page 3

third floor plans generally retain the original layout while incorporating minor modifications for functional requirements. The 2-car detached garage is connected to the house with a covered entry porch. No specific information is provided regarding the exterior treatment, materials, windows, doors, roofing etc. It is assumed the intention will be to restore existing elements where possible, particularly original or early fabric.

Conclusion: The proposed design of the Manor House retains the most important elements of the house. The treatment is consistent with the intent to preserve and rehabilitate the historic structures at Lochiel Farm. More specific information should be provided regarding exterior materials, products and finishes. Commonwealth concludes the proposed rehabilitation of the Manor House is appropriate.

Tenant House – Site #339

The proposed design of the Tenant House involves its relocation to a new basement foundation adjacent to the Manor House. The design retains the exterior appearance and scale of the existing frame house. A new frame addition of similar size and massing will be constructed to the rear with an interconnecting vertical circulation zone. This design cleverly maintains the original building's integrity at both the interior and exterior. The historic interior spaces are preserved while the overall design accommodates modern functions and spatial requirements. The 2-car detached garage is connected to the house with a covered entry porch leading to an informal family entrance in the circulation zone. No specific information is provided regarding the exterior treatment, materials, windows, doors, roofing etc. It is assumed the intention will be to restore existing elements where possible, particularly original or early fabric.

Conclusion: The proposed design of the Tenant House retains the original form of the house while greatly expanding the overall space. The treatment is consistent with the intent to preserve and rehabilitate the historic structures at Lochiel Farm, while accommodating modern living requirements. More specific information should be provided regarding exterior materials, products and finishes. Commonwealth concludes the proposed rehabilitation of the Tenant House is appropriate.

General Recommendations for the Lochiel Farm Development:

1. Provide more specific information regarding exterior treatment, materials, products and finishes for review by the Historical Commission.
2. All work at the Manor House (Site #341) and the Tenant House (Site #339) should preserve the buildings' existing architectural fabric and character where possible. This includes the preservation of distinctive exterior and interior features such as masonry, windows, doors, staircases, fireplace surrounds, and woodwork.
3. All renovation/rehabilitation work shall be in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and therefore consistent with the requirements outlined in the Section 325-90, *Standards for rehabilitation*, of the West Whiteland Township Zoning Ordinance.

Should you have any questions or comments please do not hesitate to contact this office.

Regards,



Philip Yocum, RA, LEED AP
Preservation Architect

cc: Justin Smiley - WWT
Candice Myruski - CHG

**WEST WHITELAND TOWNSHIP
HISTORICAL COMMISSION
MINUTES
December 9, 2019**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Joshua Anderson, John Kabli, Joe McCormick, John Pendergast,
Julie Bauer

TOWNSHIP STAFF: Justin Smiley, Township Planner
Phil Yocum, Historic Consultant, Commonwealth Heritage Group
Candace Strawley, Commonwealth Heritage Group

I. Call to Order – the meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m.

II. Approval of Minutes for November 14, 2019

Motion: To approve the minutes of November 14, 2019, as presented.
(McCormick/Anderson)

Vote: Passed, 5-0

III. Public Comment

There was no public comment.

IV. Old Business

1. Historic Resource Survey Update Kickoff Meeting

The Township received a Vision Partnership grant through the County to update its current historic resources. Mr. Smiley introduced Jeannine Spears with the Chester County Planning Commission, who will be the grant monitor for the Historic Resource Survey project. As such, she will be a non-voting member of the Task Force.

Ms. Spears reviewed the roles and responsibilities for the County, Township, and Consultant for the project, and then reviewed the key provisions of the three-party contract for the grant. Tonight's meeting constitutes the initial briefing meeting required by the contract. Future meetings for the survey work should be dedicated solely to the project and not include other historical commission work in an effort to keep the project moving. Justin Smiley will act as Ms. Spears' point of contact. The grant is a reimbursement grant which means the Township will prepay the consulting team and other associated expenses and then apply to the County for reimbursement once formally accepted. The total cost is \$51,900 with the Township funding 47% and the remaining 53% coming from the grant. The term of the contract is November 1, 2019 through October 31, 2021.

Consultant responsibilities include submission of materials at least a week in advance of the meetings. The primary responsibility of the Township is to review the materials submitted by the Consultant, and the primary responsibility of the County is to monitor the project.

Mr. Kabli asked Ms. Spears if "age" is a criterion used by other municipalities in designating historic resources. Ms. Spears indicated that most try to follow the National Register criteria and still have the 50-year age in place, however if looking at architecture, then age is not a priority. However, she added that

the State is encouraging local values be established to focus on what the community values and desires to protect without having to go through the National Register process.

Ms. Strawley then reviewed the Scope of Work noting project goals to include creating an updated and comprehensive inventory of West Whiteland Township historic resources and help implement the Township's existing zoning ordinance by making inventory available on a digital format supported across multiple platforms, including GIS applications. The main survey tasks include surveying and photographing everything in the existing inventory – about 210 resources - updating information and surveying additional resources 45 years and older but not recorded during the previous inventory. Recommendations will then be prepared using the new criteria established.

An application called Collector will be used to collect the survey data. While everything will be inventoried, not all will actually make it to the inventory map. Information about the properties will be provided to the Commission to select. Letters will be sent to property owners in January 2020 notifying them of the survey and the possibility that someone will come onto their property, and the Police Department will be notified. However, as much work as possible will be done from the public rights-of-way.

Ms. Strawley estimated that in March of 2020, existing data will be gathered to build a data base, with the survey beginning when snow is gone and before new leaves come out. Work will continue through the spring and summer months completing the field survey by August of 2020. A Fall public meeting with the survey results will be held, an update to the booklet by January 2021, and a project completion date of March 2021 when another public meeting will be held.

Mr. Smiley will check to be sure the Township has Janice Earley's updates to the History of West Whiteland Township book.

Early next year, Ms. Strawley will present to the Commission a draft of the categories of information that will be collected in the field for approval.

The creation of historic districts was discussed. Ms. Strawley said she will include recommendations and mapping for collections of resources that look like they belong together or have a cohesive theme. The advantage of historic districts is that when modifications are proposed to one building, rather than being treated as a stand-alone structure, the potential affect on other buildings within the district can be considered. This can result in enhancing property values. There was further discussion about HARBs. Ms. Spears said HARBs have a perceived reputation for being intense and antagonistic, but she said they don't have to be and noted that many do not operate in that manner.

V. Historical Commission Concerns

Mr. Kabli reported that a new window has been installed at the historic Miller House and the shutters have been stood up and the surrounding area cleaned up a little.

Mr. Yocum said he visited the house that was planned to be demolished as part of the Exton Knoll project. He felt it was probably a tenant house from the late 19th century, and while it still has some existing historic details, he said it is very much compromised and would be a difficult argument to make to save the structure.

Mr. Kabli commented on the importance moving forward in keeping the rural visual along the Route 30 corridor. Trees will become increasingly more important here to maintain the historic rural appearance of the Township.

Mr. McCormick reported that Site #234, a Class II resource located at 244 N. Whitford Road, is currently on the market for sale. He also reported that he took pictures of the progress of the Malvern Federal renovation as well as the Lochiel Farm project.

Mr. Yocum advised of renovations being done at the former motor court on Route 30.

Mr. Anderson noted the need to standardize the process to be followed for the annual Historic Preservation Awards. He provided a proposed timeline of tasks to be completed to ensure everything gets done without a last-minute rush. The members considered the pros and cons of plaques vs. framed picture/certificate. Mr. Yocum suggested the property owner be listed somewhere on the award. Mr. Anderson said this was omitted to protect privacy.

Commission members thanked Mr. Anderson for his hard work and service to the Commission. As a newly-elected member of the Board of Supervisors, Mr. Anderson will no longer be a member of the Historical Commission but will serve as the Board of Supervisors' liaison to the Commission.

VII. ADJOURNMENT:

Motion: To adjourn the meeting. (Anderson/Bauer)

Vote: Passed, 5-0

Recording Secretary,

Justin Smiley, AICP
Township Planner